

# VU Research Portal

## **Labour: Shaving in the Benefits of Growth [Review of: C. Manning, J. Hardjono (1996) Indonesia Assessment 1993]**

Keppy, P.J.

### ***published in***

Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde  
1996

### ***document version***

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

### ***citation for published version (APA)***

Keppy, P. J. (1996). Labour: Shaving in the Benefits of Growth [Review of: C. Manning, J. Hardjono (1996) Indonesia Assessment 1993]. *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde*, 151 (3), 455-458.

### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

### **E-mail address:**

[vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl](mailto:vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl)



## Book Reviews

- Rogier Busser, Peter Post, *Japanse bedrijvigheid in Indonesië, 1868-1942; Structurele elementen van Japans vooroorlogse economische expansie in Zuidoost Azië*. Proefschrift Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, 1991, xviii + 374 pp.
- H.J.M. Claessen, Arne Aleksej Perminow, *The long way home; Dilemmas of everyday life in a Tongan village*. Oslo: Scandinavian University Press, 1993, 166 pp.
- Aone van Engelenhoven, René van den Berg, *Studies in Sulawesi linguistics III*. Jakarta: Badan Penyelenggara Seri Nusa, Universitas Katolik Indonesia Atma Jaya, 1994, xii + 116 pp. [NUSA, Linguistic Studies of Indonesian and Other Languages in Indonesia 36.]
- Will Derks, Wolfgang Marschall, *Texts from the Islands; Oral and written traditions of Indonesia and the Malay world*, (Proceedings of the 7th European Colloquium on Indonesia and Malay Studies, Berne, June 1989) 1994, iii + 411 pp. [Ethnologica Bernensia 4].
- Michael Kaden, Krishna Sen, *Indonesian Cinema; Framing the New Order*, London: Zed Books, 1994, x + 188 pp.
- Nico Kaptein, Mona Abaza, *Indonesian Students in Cairo; Islamic education perceptions and exchanges*, Paris: Association Archipel, 1994, 198 pp. [Cahier d'Archipel 23.]
- P. Keppy, Chris Manning, *Indonesia assessment 1993; Labour: Sharing in the benefits of growth?* Canberra: Australian National University, 1993, xxi + 326 pp., Joan Hardjono (eds.)
- Anke Niehof, Jan-Paul Dirkse, *Development and social welfare; Indonesias experiences under the New Order*, Leiden: KITLV Press, 1993, xi + 295 pp., Frans Hüsken, Mario Rutten (eds.)
- Hetty Nooy-Palm, Michale C. Howard, *Textiles of Southeast Asia; An annotated and illustrated bibliography*. Bangkok: White Lotus, 1994, 212 pp. + 64 pp. pf photographs in colour.
- Harry A. Poeze, Hans van Miert, *Een koel hoofd en een warm hart; Nationalisme, Javanisme en jeugdbeweging in Nederlands-Indië, 1918-1930*. Amsterdam: De Bataafsche Leeuw, 1995, 424 pp.
- Ger P. Reesink, Jürg Wassmann, *Historical atlas of ethnic and linguistic groups in Papua New Guinea, Volume 3, Part 4: New Britain; Part 5: New Ireland; Part 6: Bougainville*, Basel: Wepf/University of Basel, Institute of Ethnology, 1995, ix + 185 pp, 30 maps.
- Ger P. Reesink, Verena Keck, *Historical atlas of ethnic and linguistic groups in Papua New Guinea, Volume 1, Part 3: Madang*, Basel: Wepf/University of Basel, Institute of Ethnology, 1995, x + 399 pp, 10 maps.
- K. Tauchmann, Reimar Schefold, *Minahasa past and present; Tradition and transition in an outer island region of Indonesia*, Leiden: Research School CNWS, 1995, 128 pp.
- Reinout Vos, Barbara Watson Andaya, *To live as brothers; Southeast Sumatra in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1993, xvii + 324 pp.

In: Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde 151 (1995), no: 3, Leiden, 446-470

**This PDF-file was downloaded from <http://www.kitlv-journals.nl>**

## Book Reviews

Peter Post, *Japanse bedrijvigheid in Indonesië, 1868-1942; Structurele elementen van Japan's vooroorlogse economische expansie in Zuidoost Azië*. Proefschrift Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, 1991, xviii + 374 pp.

ROGIER BUSSER

Over the last twenty-five years we have witnessed some major changes in the approaches and methodologies used by Asian, Japanese historians in particular, when dealing with Asian history. Running parallel to the ideas of scholars like Braudel, Asian historians have developed methodologies to study the history of Asian nations from a broader regional perspective, thereby rejecting the 'Eurocentric standard of reference'.<sup>1</sup> This methodology shifts the emphasis to cross-cultural influences that have taken place in Asia, besides claiming more attention for indigenous Asian factors.

The background to this approach is based on the assumption that Western approaches fall short because they *ipso facto* lack the ability to recognize the importance of Asian factors. In the case of Japanese history, for example, it is reasoned that modernization theories, namely that Japan to some degree at least followed a Western model, do not sufficiently acknowledge the continuity between modern and pre-modern Japan.

In the study of pre-war Japanese economic expansion in Asia, the focus has shifted somewhat away from the analysis of Western colonizing systems and there has been a concentration of focus on the persistence of continuity between Asian economic systems. This approach in itself can, at least partly, be regarded as an attempt by Japanese scholars to use conceptualizations of Japanese history for discussing the history of other Asian countries.

Consequently, Japanese economic historians are pointing more and more to the unique roles of Chinese traders, indigenous trading networks, and Japanese involvement in the region as vital factors for analysing economic development in pre-war Southeast Asia. In some recent Japanese publications we are now witnessing a second change in the approach to Asian history. Here we find a bias towards emphasizing Asian factors over Western influences to the extent that these are exhibiting revisionist ten-

---

<sup>1</sup> See Shinya Sugiyama *Japan's Industrialization in the World Economy 1859-99; Export Trade and Overseas Competition*. London: Athlone Press 1988.

dencies. In some instances, under the banner of the so-called 'New Asianism' that is nowadays widely discussed in East Asia, the role and importance of Western influences is largely trivialized.

The basic assumption in Peter Post's doctoral thesis is highly influenced by the concept of analysing Indonesian economic development from an Asian perspective. By scrutinizing Japanese economic activities in pre-war Indonesia, Post sets himself to describe the activities of different Japanese actors in great detail. In a second step his study evolves as a re-evaluation of the importance of Japanese economic activities to the economic development of Indonesia. Thirdly, Post concludes that to some extent at least Japanese economic activities in pre-war Indonesia were responsible for changes in the socio-economic position of several ethnic groups there.

The structure of this thesis is straightforward. After general descriptions of the Japanese trade expansion into Asia (Chapter 1), the role of government and private sector in Japan (Chapter 2) and positioning the Japanese in the society of the Netherlands East Indies (Chapter 5), Post sets out to analyse the importance of the economic role of the Japanese society in Indonesia.

Throughout this study Post makes an interesting distinction between the large-size Japanese companies in Indonesia on the one hand, and the important group of individual Japanese farmers and traders on the other. The first group maintained extensive contacts with Tokyo, and therefore had financial facilities, whereas, until the late 1930s, the latter could scarcely count upon any assistance from Japan. Post argues that the two groups converged in the late 1930s so that all could contribute to the expansion of the military-industrial apparatus. It seems that this original argument needs further factual underpinning in future research, because in this study the reasons behind this convergence remain partly unexplained. Was it just the breakdown of the world economic system in 1929 that forced small Japanese traders to become incorporated in the networks of large companies? Or was there a consciously planned attempt by the Japanese government to reorganize the overseas activities of Japanese companies large and small and to integrate these into one network? The solid case study on the Japanese logging activities on southeastern Borneo (Chapter 10), does not illuminate this point satisfactorily.

It is interesting to see that in this study Post more or less follows the methodology of scholars like Sugiyama, but unlike these Asian scholars does not make extensive use of Asian sources. On the contrary, Post is persuasive in the main arguments of this research through his extensive use of Dutch archives and sources. Hopefully this study will soon be translated into English, so that Post's great efforts can be thrown open to a larger international audience for discussion.

---

Arne Aleksej Perminow, *The long way home; Dilemmas of everyday life in a Tongan village*. Oslo: Scandinavian University Press, 1993, 166 pp. ISBN 82.00.41092.7.

H.J.M. CLAESSEN

Within the compass of this relatively small book, Perminow succeeds in presenting a thorough description and analysis of Tongan family life. He collected his data on the atoll Kotu, one of the Ha'apai Islands, where about 200 people live. Building on the theoretical views of Frederick Barth, he tries to understand why change in such a strongly traditional society is difficult to achieve. As a starting point for his analysis he uses a seminar, conducted by evangelist preachers, during which the virtues of the traditional *kava* drinking were juxtaposed with the sins of modern alcohol abuse. The analysis of this ceremony leads Perminow to a description of the traditional *kavatonga*, the ceremonially drinking of *kava* by a group of people. It appears that sons and fathers only seldom take part in the same *kavatonga*. This enables him to go into the complex relations between fathers and sons. Generally speaking, the father always has the right to command, and the son has the duty to obey. Father's side of the family – and especially father's sister – is the harsh one; respect and obedience are owed to its members. On the other hand, mother's side of the family is the affection side; especially mother's brother is patient and forbearing towards his sister's children. To complicate matters a strong brother/sister *tapu* has been identified in the Tonga Archipelago. And, as a consequence of the classificatory kinship system, this *tapu* is extended to all female cousins, and cousins of cousins. Thus, for young men life on Kotu is full of obligations and avoidances. It is, for example, practically impossible for them to attend a *kava* party; either the father or father's brothers/sisters are present, which means they have to behave in a very submissive way, or a sister, a cousin, or a cousin of a cousin attends, and then they are simply not allowed to be present. Perminow adduces this situation to explain why young men leave the island. Not, as is so often assumed, a shortage of land, or the possibility to earn money elsewhere, but the deep-felt need to be quit of an overbearing father, and the omnipresence of tabooed female relations are the prime factors.

Perminow presents his data in a lucid, lively style; the book is extremely readable – though its contents are often rather complex. Because of its wide scope the book is warmly recommended to all those interested in the societies of the Pacific and to those interested in the study of (the actual working of) kinship systems.

---

René van den Berg (ed.), *Studies in Sulawesi linguistics III*. Jakarta: Badan Penyelenggara Seri Nusa, Universitas Katolik Indonesia Atma Jaya, 1994, xii + 116 pp. [NUSA, Linguistic Studies of Indonesian and Other Languages in Indonesia 36.] ISSN 0126.2874. Price: US\$ 15.

AONE VAN ENGELHOFEN

This volume is the first in the *Studies in Sulawesi Linguistics* series which is completely devoted to grammar. The first three languages discussed are all spoken in Central Sulawesi.

Robert L. Busenitz (pp. 1-15) discusses diathesis in Belantak. Inflection on the verb indicates whether the actor (actor focus, AF) or the patient (goal focus, GF) is the topic of the clause. The AF prefixes display vowel harmony with the base. Both AF and GF markings have distinct forms for realis and irrealis.

Marjo Karhunen (pp. 17-47) describes the structure of the Padoe or South Mori noun phrase. Except for the article, numerals, and quantifiers, all modifiers follow the head. Because of their importance to other parts of the noun phrase, the author discusses reduplication (indicating plurality or diminutiveness) and verbal nominalization (referring to locations, tools, and results) in an introduction. Closed classes like the many demonstratives are dealt with in great detail.

Kathryn B. Lawkoske (pp. 49-64) provides an analysis of the negation patterns in Seko Padang. This language has a separate negator preclitic for main clauses and subordinate clauses (conditional, relative or nominalized clauses). Whereas positive verbs have pronominal proclitics, their negative counterparts require enclitics, for example:

- |   |                 |        |    |             |
|---|-----------------|--------|----|-------------|
| i | Ha=malompo=ka'  | versus | ii | Ku=malompo. |
|   | neg=be.fat=1sg  |        |    | 1sg=be.fat  |
|   | 'I am not fat.' |        |    | 'I am fat.' |

The other two contributions focus on South Sulawesi languages.

David F. Matti's (pp. 65-113) paper provides an analysis of Mamasa verb agreement. The author touches upon the ergativity hypothesis which has been questioned recently. Himmelman (1991) argues that the so-called 'ergative' pronominal proclitic does not always mark an actor in many languages of this region, as for example in the Mamasa consecutive (glossed CNS) clause. Here, the proclitic also marks (intransitive) subjects (iii) which otherwise requires an enclitic (iv):

- |     |                              |        |    |                    |
|-----|------------------------------|--------|----|--------------------|
| iii | ... an-ta-lao.               | versus | iv | Lao-kan lako kota. |
|     | CNS-1plinc-go                |        |    | go-1plex to town   |
|     | '... and then we (will) go.' |        |    | 'We went to town.' |

Matti considers this nominative phenomenon to be a split. This is fully

consistent with the other morphologically ergative languages known from the literature.

The final contribution by Kari K. Strømme (pp. 91-113) discusses Mamuju person marking which displays an ergative-absolutive pattern. The antipassive construction where absolutive enclitics mark agents (transitive subjects) is analysed in terms of 'actor focus'.

This volume contains many interesting details which sometimes need further elaboration. For example, I came across the notion of focus several times without finding any descriptive merit. As becomes clear from the editor's introduction, a comparison with Part IV will provide an overall picture of the typology of this region.

#### Reference

- Himmelman, Nikolaus, 'Person marking and grammatical relations in Sulawesi', Paper read at the Sixth International Conference of Austronesian Linguistics, Honolulu, 1991.

---

Wolfgang Marschall (ed.), *Texts from the islands; Oral and written traditions of Indonesia and the Malay world*, (Proceedings of the 7th European Colloquium on Indonesian and Malay studies, Berne, June 1989) 1994, iii + 411 pp. [Ethnologica Bernensia 4]. ISBN 390.6465.101.1.

WILL DERKS

Where should one begin discussing a book that contains twenty-four essays of various length, by different authors, written in English, French or Indonesian and dealing with topics such as an analysis of Soekarno's rhetoric, the image of the village in Malaysian novellas, an Indonesian concept to overcome *angst*, piety and pleasure in Islamic religious schools in Java, the commoditization of historical records in Ambon and oral autobiography in West Sumba? Indeed, 'the field is immense,' as the editor remarks in his introduction. Only slightly exaggerating – and mindful of present-day uses of the term 'text' – one could say that such a book might well bear a title like 'Things from the Archipelago' without being less informative than 'Texts from the Islands'.

'A volume of proceedings cannot be a unified opus,' the editor goes on to note. Really? The fact that the contributions to this publication are organized into five parts suggests that a more unifying title for the 7th European Colloquium on Indonesian and Malay Studies, and for its subsequent proceedings, could well have been possible. However, the impression one gets now, after slogging through the more than 400 pages of this volume, is that there exists hardly any dialogue between the



individual essays. All contributions do something with texts from some island somewhere. At the same time there is a virtual silence about recent theoretical achievements. There are hardly any references, except some ill-understood ones, to contemporary insights into problems of orality, literacy, literariness, textuality and so forth.

I was rather puzzled that the welcome address by the Indonesian ambassador to Switzerland was published in the proceedings, since this meeting was scholarly and not political. An official explanation of the Pancasila ideology is what one could expect from an Indonesian diplomatic representative. Yet, in the short article by Ingo Wandelt on Pancasila and the New Order, the critical distance that a scholarly approach requires is lacking. As is true with most papers in this volume, this particular essay reflects a virtual absence of commitment to, say, the cause of certain individuals, groups or peoples in Indonesia today, to which Pancasila may be a mixed blessing.

Only one contribution to this book could probably count as *engagé*, but, perhaps not surprisingly, it focuses on the Philippines. Niels Mulder presents fascinating material in his discussion of the remarkable Filipino penchant for 'self-flagellation' in textbooks for schools and universities. An answer to the question as to why exactly the Filipino government fosters a negative self-image in these textbooks may be open to debate, but Mulder's presentation gives much food for thought.

There seems to be a lack of editorial oversight in many of the essays. For example, the denomination of the Dutch colonial administration as 'racist' and 'paternalistic', as is done by Werner Kraus throughout his essay on the Javanese dandy-painter Raden Saleh, is hardly breaking any new ground. Remarkably, Raden Saleh was taken to the Netherlands under the auspices of the Dutch government, he was taught Dutch, mathematics and portrait and landscape painting by well-known teachers, he had love affairs with 'white Dutch women' (*sic!*), the government paid his tailor bills and sent him on a trip through Europe, he corresponded with the Dutch Minister of Colonies J.C. Baud and he conversed with the King. In contrast to what Kraus argues Raden Saleh hardly seems to be an exemplary victim of the Dutch colonial system.

Apparently Kraus also wants to illustrate the 'disastrous effects of Dutch language policy' by pointing at the kind of Malay Saleh wrote in his letters to Baud in comparison with those in German to the Duke of Saxen-Coburg. The pitiful stammer called 'brabbel-Maleisch' that, according to Kraus, Saleh was forced to use in relation to his colonial overlord was supposedly a hindrance to intellectual and spiritual development. Ironically, Kraus here echoes the opinions of colonial scholars such as Pijnappel, who did not consider Malay a real language.

There are problems too with Karel Steenbrink's contribution. He limits his remarks on the oral aspects of the *Bustan us-Salat* to a section of five sentences in which he declares that 'interjunctions like *bermula*, *adapun*,

*syahdan...* and many other (*sic*), are among the main indicators of this work's oral character. Oddly he considers Raniri, the author of the enormous seventeenth-century work, a novelist (!) 'with a style of writing that did not produce real masterpieces of Malay literature'. This judgement is apparently based on only a partial reading of the text concerned.

H. Schulte Nordholt, in his sound discussion of the historical reliability of some Balinese texts could have benefitted from not taking worn-out structuralist terminology such as 'literary motifs' and 'literary themes' for granted. The final contribution of Rainer Carle, about the role of Greek tragedy in Indonesian theatre, strikes me as a confused amalgam of ideas, presented in a most peculiar English. As far as the English language is concerned, the same holds true for the Bengkulu fieldwork papers by some of the editor's students.

In sum, this review may come across as highly, maybe over-critical. This criticism is only in part directed at the contents of some of the contributions to this book. If the collected essays would accurately represent the current state of European research on Indonesian texts, there seems to be enough reason for some self-criticism. However, my main objection is that I do not really see the sense of putting proceedings like these together into one book. Maybe it would have been wiser, as was done with the European colloquium at Passau earlier, to cluster papers according to discipline, subject them to a rigorous editing and bring them out as several separate volumes.

---

Krishna Sen, *Indonesian cinema; Framing the New Order*, London: Zed Books, 1994, x + 188 pp. ISBN 1.85649.123.4 (hardback), 1.85649.124.2 (paperback).

MICHAEL KADEN

Compared to the large volume of literature on 'big' Asian film-nations, such as India, China, and Japan, publications on more peripheral film-cultures – like the Vietnamese, Thai, or Indonesian ones – are strikingly rare. Turning to the last-mentioned cinema, Krishna Sen's new book appears to be one of the most comprehensive studies to have been published internationally so far. In comparison with Karl Heider's *Indonesian Cinema: National Culture on Screen* (University of Hawaii Press, Honolulu, 1991) and Salim Said's *Shadows on the Silver Screen: A Social History of Indonesian Films* (Lontar Foundation, Jakarta, 1991), Sen's publication adds an explicitly critical analysis of this particular 'Third World' medium.

Referring to the ideological role cinema performed in Indonesia between 1965 and 1990 Sen – a lecturer at Murdoch University, Australia – defines her critical perspective as follows: 'If 1965 is a victory of the state against

the society, and of the capitalist-priyayi-male against their "others" (various and contradictory), that victory is not, however, an ultimate closure. Anxieties anchored in the experience of the civil war of 1965, are not obliterated once and for all by the victory itself, but must be constantly symbolically reproduced in order to be symbolically contained.' Before she demonstrates in detail how single Indonesian films, that is film-texts, fulfil this particular, ideological function, she displays a sound frame of reference by analysing the economic, political, and institutional development of the medium since the early 1900s. Especially in her depiction of the post-1965 development Sen succeeds in giving a clear picture of the industrial structure of Indonesian cinema, while her explanations on the pre-war period contain some inaccuracies and shortcomings. The musical *Terang Boelan* (Full Moon, 1937), for example, the first box-office success for a movie produced in the colony, and a key-film for popular cinema in Indonesia, is referred to – without deeper analysis – as 'Indonesia's first sound film', which is simply not correct, as attempts by domestic producers to compete with the imported 'talkies' had already started in the early 1930s.

In the second part of her study ('Society and Politics in Film Texts'), Sen carries out a critical deconstruction of the ideological message of single films and genres of Indonesian cinema under the New Order. Her explanations on historical films offer a particularly interesting insight into the grammar of the medium within the context of a broader political discourse in Indonesian society. Nevertheless, there is a general problem in dealing with detailed film studies of peripheral cinemas: most of the readers usually have not had the chance to see a relevant percentage of the films analysed. Therefore a discussion of the author's interpretation is limited. In this context another gap in this well-edited book is exposed, namely that a filmography of the movies referred to in the analysis is missing. Despite any shortcomings, Krishna Sen's book adds an important critical point of view to the scholarly debate on Indonesian cinema – a medium that nowadays is hard hit by the competition from new means of communication, like satellite-television, or laser-discs.

---

Mona Abaza, *Indonesian students in Cairo; Islamic education perceptions and exchanges*, Paris: Association Archipel, 1994, 198 pp. [Cahier d'Archipel 23.] ISBN 2.910513.01.7.

NICO KAPTEIN

This book is the commercial edition of the author's doctoral dissertation which was prepared under the supervision of Professor Hans-Dieter Evers, and submitted at the University of Bielefeld in 1990. Major parts of

Chapters 3-6 of the book have earlier appeared in print,<sup>1</sup> but it is nevertheless convenient that these interesting contributions are now available in one single volume.

In the introduction the author announces that she will analyse the influence of the famous centre of classical Islamic learning, the Egyptian al-Azhar University, on Indonesian Muslims and, at a higher level, she wants to study the exchange of Islamic scholarship between Egypt and Indonesia. The first chapter starts with a brief history of al-Azhar up to the present day. An important year in this history was 1961, because this was when secular studies were introduced into the curriculum. Having set the scene, the author examines al-Azhar as a traditional intellectual centre from which, in particular from the beginning of the twentieth century, new ideas spread throughout the entire Muslim world. The second chapter delves into this dissemination in more detail, focusing on Indonesia. The third chapter sketches the life histories of a number of influential Indonesians who studied in Cairo in the past. This chapter shows that in colonial times, upon their return from the Middle East, students played an important role in Indonesia. The same is true for the first decades after Independence, when al-Azhar alumni started to assume important state functions upon their return to their country of origin. Chapter 4 sketches the growing influence of Islam in the political and intellectual atmosphere in Egypt and Indonesia in the 1970s and 1980s. The rest of the chapters of the book are the result of fieldwork among Indonesian students in Cairo, carried out at the end of the 1980s: Chapters 5 and 6 deal with the living conditions of the students and their world view, while Chapter 7 pays particular attention to female students. The book is rounded off with a conclusion in which the author draws together her ideas.

The most important part of the book lies in the parts which are based on fieldwork among Indonesian students in Cairo, which was mostly undertaken in March-September 1988 and April 1989. The image which emerges from these chapters is rather saddening: the Indonesian students who go to Cairo often have to live in deplorable conditions; the instruction they receive in Cairo often leaves much to be desired, and many of the students do not graduate. One important question which is touched upon briefly in this book, but not really answered, is in how far these students function as transmitters of Middle Eastern radical and militant ideas about Islam after their return in Indonesia, as is often assumed.

The book contains many interesting observations, but would have profited from a stricter final editing. At times, information is given in places the reader would not expect it, e.g. pp. 122-124 contain valuable information on the involvement of Indonesian students in Cairo with the pilgrimage to

---

<sup>1</sup> In the *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies* 22-2 (September 1991):347-360, and in the author's *Changing Images of Three Generations of Azharites in Indonesia*, Singapore: ISEAS, 1993.

Mecca. This information is included in a section entitled, 'The Students' Hostel: *Madinat al-Bu'uth*'. In view of this sometimes weak organization of the book, an index would have been most welcome, making the contents of this publication more accessible. Another aid which would have helped the reader would have been a number of tables containing statistics of the numbers of students in the various educational institutions in different periods. The most recent information about this is given on p. 104, where it is mentioned that, according to the records of the Indonesian Embassy in Cairo, in 1987 there were 722 Indonesian students in Cairo, of whom 585 were studying at al-Azhar University, while the remainder was registered elsewhere. In 1989 482 Indonesian students were enrolled in al-Azhar.<sup>2</sup> Notwithstanding this decrease, since this year these numbers seem to have increased again, judging from page 104, note 3 in Dr. Abaza's book, in which she states that in 1993 the students in Cairo estimated their number to be approximately one thousand. Despite the sometimes weak presentation of the subject matter, the publication of this book is certainly a welcome contribution to the fascinating field of study, which deals with the intellectual relations between the Middle East and Southeast Asia.

---

<sup>2</sup> Bernard Botiveau, 'Note sur les étudiants indonésiens présents à l'Université Al-Azhar du Caire', *Archipel* 40(1990):41-44, esp. 43.

---

Chris Manning and Joan Hardjono (eds), *Indonesia assessment 1993; Labour: Sharing in the benefits of growth?* Canberra: Australian National University, 1993, xxi + 326 pp. ISBN 0.7315.1838.1.

P. KEPPY

The *Update* (and *Assessment*) is a co-operative project between the Indonesian Project (Department of Economics) and the Department of Political and Social Change, Australian National University. Each year the *Assessment* deals with a subject of topical interest. There are no specific guidelines with regard to the contributors. Usually Indonesian government or quasi-government personnel are involved, along with more independent spokespersons who give their views on government programmes and policies.

This time we find a range of themes and views from macro to micro perspectives, for instance as offered by the Director General of Industrial Relations and Labour Standards, Payaman Simanjuntak, of the Indonesian Department of Manpower to 'independent' researchers such as Thamrin

and Tjandraningsih. In between we find established scholars such as Graeme Hugo, Chris Manning, Masri Simarimbun, Ben White, and others.

The diversity in backgrounds of the contributors and the divergent perspectives and topics are neatly organized into two general parts, A and B, and consequently subdivided into themes, adding to the readability of the book. Part A covers general macro-economic and political aspects, introducing the reader to Indonesia's political and economic environment, and contains two articles, by Sjahrir on the economy and Liddle on politics.

Sjahrir argues that Indonesia's economy would be better understood if micro-level developments in it were linked up to developments at the macro level. To make his point he uses the government's domestic trade policy as a case study. His emphasis, however, turns out not to reveal the merits and problems of micro-macro linkage analysis, as he quickly skips on to the problem of the domination of the Indonesian economy by conglomerates. Deregulation of the economy is Sjahrir's main advice.

The main theme in Liddle's contribution is the debate about President Suharto's political longevity. Suharto has effectively forged alliances to co-opt potential political enemies, civilian (Muslims) or the military. In this political configuration of the president's checks and balances, rising star Habibie, the Minister of Technology, plays an important role. Liddle carefully avoids slipping into a popular debate about Suharto's successor in office. He does, however, give us the general picture of political forces in present Indonesian society. Of these forces the army still holds the highest cards.

Part B is actually focused on labour, and is subdivided in four main themes 1. macro aspects; 2. factory and wage workers; 3. women and child workers and the informal sector; 4. village workers.

In his overview under the heading 'macro-aspects', Manning gives a balanced review of the pros and cons in respect to the evaluation of employment and wages in Indonesia. One positive aspect is that many new jobs have been created. Negative aspects are the persistence of low wages and stagnation in real wage rates. Some of the issues treated, mainly on employment, are given more detailed analysis by the following contributors. A minor point which may surprise the reader is Manning's reference to 'stages of development' in the Indonesian economy. This could give the impression that Indonesia is following a necessary and thus predictable linear economic development, typical of all 'poor' countries.

The following article is by Ross McLeod, who gives a highly critical analysis of the worker's social security legislation which was launched in 1992 by the government. Part of the insurance packet covers health. McLeod argues that the general inexperience with health insurance in Indonesia, both in the private and public sector, the lack of a sufficient number of doctors and hospital services make it unlikely that the system be implemented with any success.

Apart from the practical problems of the monitoring of the programme by government officials, the costs of the project will also be too high in the absence of any direct financial contributions by workers. McLeod quite rightly refers to the many government-sponsored insurance systems in West Europe, which suffer from increasing demands on medical services and rising costs for governments and consumers. In addition, in the Indonesian case workers cannot choose between different insurance companies who offer different insurance packets against competitive prices, as the programme is monopolized by one company, PT Astek.

Kartini Sjahrir's study on 'informality' and employment in the construction sector in Jakarta (pp. 240-260) confirms some of McLeod's predictions. The reader can only come to the conclusion that the programme appears to be merely a showcase for the world to see that Indonesia is seriously concerned with the social welfare of its working population. However, after reading McLeod's devastating critique, doubt may easily be cast on such a conclusion.

Graeme Hugo's article is on international labour migration. Although Hugo admits the lack of data, the article is enough to arouse curiosity among the readers and potential researchers. One such instance is labour migration of Indonesians to Malaysia. Hugo gives some references to forthcoming publications about labour migration.

The part on factory work clearly reveals the heterogeneous perspectives and backgrounds of the contributors. Ben White and Juni Thamrin offer critical analyses of labour in textile and shoe manufacturing in West Java, while H.P. Lok's article tries to capture the employers' rationale in their dealings with labour in a garment business. G.D. Klinger offers a story of harmonious labour relations in a mining company, not surprisingly as he is the former managing director of the company involved. In contrast to these different perspectives, Vedi Hadiz takes the 'classical' debate on class formation and class identity as his point of departure in his efforts to trace the rise of a new industrial working class in West Java. He argues that new working-class-based organizations pose a challenge to the forms of labour control adopted by the New Order government. All these issues offer food for prolonged debate.

One general observation made in several of the studies is that an important shift has taken place in the composition of the labour force. More females have entered the labour market. Some of these long-term trends and specific characteristics are treated by Mayling-Oey Gardiner. She concludes that the female labour force has become increasingly better educated and therefore is more trainable. In this respect the conventional notion of Indonesia's labour force's 'unskilledness' needs revision. Mies Grijns and Anita van Velsen go further into the composition of the female labour force and pay attention to work status and gender differentiation. They relate this to the question of marginalization of women. Indeed, women in general are offered lower wages than men, and women tend to

be employed in stagnating industrial sectors. The picture is even more complex, differentiation of work status among women is vast and young, unmarried, educated women are employed in large modern industries, while older women are being pushed into smaller industries, as these compete with the larger factories.

Indrasari Tjandraningsih pays attention to the rather obscure matter of child labour in Indonesia. The long denial of the existence of this phenomenon by the Indonesian government is striking. Tjandraningsih argues that child labour should not simply be abolished. It is a survival strategy and should be considered as such. She pleads for tighter government control on wages, control over labour conditions, and the possibility of establishing a child workers' labour union. This would serve the interests of children better than any effort to eliminate child labour, which realistically would be very difficult to put in practice.

In the final part headed 'village workers', Masri Singarimbun, Joan Hardjono, and Tadjuddin Nur Effendi stress a similar phenomenon, namely the unprecedented growth of employment in the non-farm sector in rural Java during the last two decades. This gives us a broader view of socio-economic changes at the village level in West and Central Java.

*Indonesia Assessment 1993* gives a good overview of labour issues as well as of trends in research on the topic. The editors do not claim to cover all aspects of labour, but have picked out the major issues. These are: the 'femalization' of the labour force; the continuing importance of the 'informal sector' as a source of employment; and the shift to non-farm labour with its inseparable phenomenon of a rising industrial working class. Nonetheless, the reader is sometimes left with some uneasiness about the rather short and general contents of some of the papers. What is also striking is the absence of a historical perspective. Studies about trends and patterns of international labour migration or on employment patterns would greatly benefit from an explicit historical approach. As to the regional focus, Java, and West Java in particular, is over-represented. This criticism is not intended as a reproach, considering that research on labour in Indonesia has been long and generally neglected, and the editors' effort in bringing together a good mix of contributors together under the banner of labour is much appreciated. Clearly the volume offers abundant food for thought and will hopefully act as a stimulus for further research. With the general economic upsurge in parts of Asia and the concomitant scholarly attention being paid to capitalist development and entrepreneurship this seems all the more necessary. The book is of great interest to anyone interested in socio-economic developments in Southeast Asia.

---



Jan-Paul Dirkse, Frans Hüsken and Mario Rutten (eds), *Development and social welfare; Indonesia's experiences under the New Order*, Leiden: KITLV Press, 1993, xi + 295 pp. ISBN 90.6718.056.4. Price: f 45.

ANKE NIEHOF

In a certain sense the present volume is a period piece. It is the outcome of a colloquium on poverty and development in Indonesia, held in The Hague in April 1991. The meeting was convened on the initiative of J.P. Pronk, then as now Minister for Development Co-operation of the Netherlands, at that time also Chairman of the IGGI, the Intergovernmental Group on Indonesia. The latter is no longer the case. In March 1992 President Suharto informed the Netherlands that Indonesia would renounce Dutch development assistance to Indonesia from then on. Thus, the book reflects a situation in which there still was a dialogue between Indonesia and the Netherlands, in which not only government representatives but also scholars and representatives from the IGGI's critical counterpart, the INGI (International NGO-Forum on Indonesia), participated. This situation came to an abrupt end in March 1992. In retrospect one could say that on the Indonesian side the terms on which the dialogue was pursued were felt to be unequal. The book also shows the involvement with Indonesia on the Dutch side, which in Dutch public opinion and foreign policy was felt as something special but – at the same time – controversial, which was typical of the period that started at the beginning of the seventies and ended in March 1992.

If its timing makes the book a historical document, this also applies to one of its central themes: poverty. For a long time poverty did not feature in the political vocabulary of the New Order. Referring to the poor, euphemisms such as 'low-income groups' or groups with a 'weak economic status' (*status ekonomi lemah*) were used, like using the phrase 'insufficient nutrition' (*kurang gizi*) when meaning malnutrition. 'In REPELITA V, the government recognized the magnitude of the poverty problem in Indonesia and the need to mount an intensified effort to reduce poverty,' say Cheetman and Kyle Peters in their contribution (p. 33). They omit to mention the role of the World Bank in putting the issue of poverty in the limelight at the beginning of the nineties. One might also regard it indicative of Indonesia's self-confidence about the success of its development efforts that in REPELITA V the problem of alleviating poverty was explicitly addressed for the first time.

The structure of the book betrays the proceedings of the meeting on which it is based. The topics – poverty, rural development, industrialization, population, women and development, participation and development policies – are dealt with in an interactive manner. A topic that I rather miss in the discussions is education, both in terms of achievement (literacy of the population) and problems (the low level of education of the Indonesian

work force). The discussants at the seminar and contributors to this volume include Russell Cheetham, R. Kyle Peters, Sjahrir, Sajogyo, Erik Thorbecke, Budhy Tjahjati Soegijoko, Chris Manning, Soetjipto Wirosardjono, Benjamin White, Ines Smyth, Els Postel-Coster, Sediono Tjondronegoro, Leon-tine Visser, Peter van Tuyl, Ben Witjes, Wardah Hafidz, Robert Cribb, and Peter Boomgaard. Pronk's concluding chapter at the end is aptly called 'Looking Backward, Looking Forward'.

The book indeed looks both backwards and forwards. The first applies not only to the historical contributions of Boomgaard and Cribb, but also that of, for example, Sajogyo, who traces agricultural and rural development policies and their effects throughout the New Order period. Sajogyo points to the top-down character of the institutions and programmes (for example KUD, LKMD and PKK) which were produced by these policies, and also to the inherent urban bias in top-down rural development. The theme of participation, which is more explicitly dealt with in the contributions of Van Tuyl, Witjes, and Wardah Hafidz, runs throughout the whole argument, as is the case in several other contributions.

Most contributions have an inherent diachronic perspective to a greater or lesser extent. In the section on women and development, Wolf's contribution is the most forward-looking one. She discusses the 'factory daughters', who are increasingly forming part of the industrial labour force. These women are young, single and come from poor, though not the poorest, rural households. They are cheap and docile labourers, but at the same time they work for their own emancipatory reasons. Soetjipto Wirosardjono's contribution on population and social welfare also looks ahead at Indonesia as it approaches the turn of the century, and identifies the problem of population ageing as a welfare issue to come.

The topic of population is interesting because of its immediate link with the controversy surrounding Indonesia's national family planning programme. Although I agree with White that 'we do not yet fully understand the relationship between population change and development' (p. 105), I do not want to deny Indonesia (or any other country for that matter) the right to have a population policy aimed at curbing population growth. However, the argument on Indonesia's family planning programme centred on its character at the level of implementation rather than that of policy. The keywords here are quality and (alleged) coercion. This is not the place to go into this matter in detail, but I would like to remind readers of the often polemic nature of the domestic (meaning Dutch) discussion on Indonesia's development and the New Order regime. White's plea for an open discussion on the issues of quality and coercion (p. 113), apart from the fact that the present tense is no longer applicable as far as the Dutch are concerned, even then came too late in the day. What in fact happened is that allegations of coercion and critical comments on quality were not properly discussed. The programme did not get a fair trial at all. The Australian parliament, confronted with the same domestic debate on Australia's

development assistance to Indonesia in the field of population and family planning, sent out a mission to investigate the allegations. It was headed by a well-known expert in the field (Terence Hull). It did a meticulous job and produced a balanced and perspicacious report. By contrast, in Holland there was a very unbalanced debate in a popular development magazine, in which the column writer (Bremen) could fire away to his heart's content and the letters of those who did not agree were either not printed in full or not even printed at all. It surprises me that White feels compelled to refer to this exchange to bolster his view. I totally disagree with White when he says (in a footnote): 'Bremen's account may indeed have been inaccurate in some details, but this does not necessarily deny the general accuracy of his characterization of the program' (p. 112). And I feel offended by White's all too short and biased summary of an argument I presented elsewhere when he quotes me as maintaining that 'there is no question of coercion' (p. 112). All this could be disposed of as academic bickering, were it not for the political effect it had. Bremen's account contributed to establishing a distorted image of the Indonesian family planning programme, which in turn in February 1991 led to the Dutch policy decision to suspend all assistance to this programme. A decision taken without first having the 'open discussion' – so wanted by White in retrospect – with Indonesian policy-makers and without having heard the party most involved, the 'acceptors' or clients. This was much resented by the Indonesian side and it played a role in the Indonesian decision of March 1992 to renounce all Dutch development assistance. As it is now, Dutch experts on Indonesia and Dutch foreign policy-makers have ceased to participate in the international discussions with Indonesia on that country's development.

---

Michael C. Howard, *Textiles of Southeast Asia; An annotated and illustrated bibliography*. Bangkok: White Lotus, 1994, 212 pp. + 64 pp. of photographs in colour. ISBN 974.8496.11.2. Price US\$ 35.

HETTY NOOY-PALM

As is clear from the title, the textiles of South-East Asia are the subject of this annotated bibliography. A real *mer à boire*, and the author, a professor in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology of the Simon Fraser University, Toronto, must be highly devoted to his subject to undertake such a Sisyphean labour. The task is also frustrating because opportunities for developing an interesting theory are few and far between, and no suggestive point of view can be brought out. This is inherent in the character of a bibliography, which is first and foremost a work of reference.

The bibliography includes works (books, catalogues, articles, and other contributions) dealing not only with the fabrication of cloth, referring to the techniques used, and to photographs and diagrams of textiles, it is also supplemented by illustrations picturing people wearing traditional costumes. A useful procedure because this enables a curator of a museum, or a textile expert, to see how a certain type of cloth is used as clothing. The bibliography is arranged as follows: firstly, reference is made to the several pages of photographs in colour, which give a pattern-card of the textiles of Southeast Asia. In the next section the textiles are divided up by country: Indonesia (a rich area, also in documentation, as it covers nearly half of the book); Malaysia, Singapore and Borneo; the Philippines; Thailand, Laos, Vietnam and Cambodia; Burma. The author admits that this division is not a satisfactory one, as boundaries often cut across ethnic groups and their cloths.

One drawback in compiling a bibliography is the risk of omitting works dealing with its subject. The author is well aware of this, and in his Preface he suggests the possibility of a future edition to solve this problem. Perhaps some works dealing with cloth and clothing, which are overlooked in this volume, could then be included. The bibliography is well-produced, with a very pleasing presentation. One flaw, however, is the number of printing errors in the names of authors and titles. For future editions we would suggest the assistance of a Dutch and/or Indonesian corrector. Indubitably this work is a valuable contribution to the subject of Southeast Asian textiles. Moreover, it is a very useful book of reference for museum curators. And, with the author, we hope that it will stimulate anthropologists and textile experts to do more research in this fascinating field.

---

Hans van Miert, *Een koel hoofd en een warm hart; Nationalisme, Javanisme en jeugdbeweging in Nederlands-Indië, 1918-1930*. Amsterdam: De Bataafsche Leeuw, 1995, 424 pp. ISBN 90.6707.388.1 Prijs f 45.

HARRY A. POEZE

De Indonesische geschiedenis kent ook zijn verschoppelingen en stiefkinderen. Hans van Miert heeft zich in zijn Leidse proefschrift over niet minder dan vier van hen ontfermd. Voor de periode 1918-1930 vertelt hij het verhaal van Boedi Oetomo, het Comité voor het Javaans Nationalisme en de jongerenorganisaties Jong Java en Jong Sumatranen Bond, alle als vertegenwoordigers van het gematigde, regionaal gerichte nationalisme achterhaald door radicale, nationalistische organisaties, met hun basis in het idee van een Indonesische staat. Die laatste uitgangspunten werden geformuleerd door studenten in Nederland in de Perhimpoean

Indonesia en na hun terugkeer uitgedragen in allerlei organisaties. Zij kregen sinds 1927 definitief vorm in PNI, PNI-Baroe en Partindo, op basis van non-coöperatie en self-help, met leiders als Soekarno en Hatta. Na 1933 werd de radicale stroming effectief onderdrukt; het ideeëngoed echter inspireerde in 1945 de Indonesische Revolutie.

Van Miert volgt Boedi Oetomo op de voet in zijn grillige ontwikkelingsgang, waarin de bezadigde, gezagsgetrouwe koers met de nadruk op het superieure Javaanse cultuurgood werd verstoord door tijdelijke politieke activiteit en radicale oprispingen. De instelling van de Volksraad dwong Boedi Oetomo, die zich zag als de spreekbuis van Java's elite, tot politieke stellingname. In de eerste jaren van de Volksraad was Boedi Oetomo sterk vertegenwoordigd en onvermijdelijk moest er worden gekozen en gestemd. Die keuzes verstoorde de harmonie in de partij en de verschillende vleugels in de partij botsten, met meestal als resultaat dat links en/of rechts het ledental afkalfde. Van Miert leidt de lezer langs al die conflicten: de deelname aan de Radicale Concentraties (1918 en 1922) in de Volksraad, de steun aan de pandhuisstaking van 1922 – met desastreuze en nooit overwonnen gevolgen voor de partij –, het niet-kiezen tussen Javaans en Indonesisch nationalisme, het terugtrekken naar culturele activiteit, en tenslotte, na het falen van politieke hervormers als Soetomo en Singgih, het vegeteren aan de politieke zijlijn, onder leiding van Solose hoge adel, gerespecteerd maar onmachtig.

Het Comité voor het Javaanse Nationalisme (1917-1923), met als spreekbuis het blad 'Wederopbouw' en als drijvende kracht Soetatmo Soerikoesoemo, vormde van 1917 tot 1923 de intellectuele kern van het cultureel Javaans nationalisme. Beïnvloed door theosofie, Tagore en Gandhi werd de morele superioriteit van de Javaanse beschaving over de Europese uitgedragen, en gepleit voor een restauratie van de glorieuze Javaanse autocratie uit prekoloniale eeuwen. De verwoording van dit alles was vaag en apolitiek; de Nederlandse ethici voelden zich niet onbehaaglijk in deze kring. Voor het Comité verliep het tij spoedig en toen Soetatmo in 1923 overleed waren Comité en blad in feite al ten onder gegaan.

Duurzamer was Jong Java, dat als kweekvijver van Boedi Oetomo diende, maar in jeugdige overmoed die partij wel eens hinderlijk voor de voeten liep. Maar het verbod tot politieke actie en discussie – voorwaarde voor erkenning door de koloniale overheid – en de sturende hand van invloedrijke ouderen hielden Jong Java meestal wel in de pas. Ook gebrek aan bestuurlijk talent en interne verdeeldheid waren mede verantwoordelijk voor de onvoorspelbare afwisseling van actie en inactiviteit. Sociaal-culturele activiteiten en discussies bepaalden het verenigingsleven, onder de inspiratie van het Javaans nationalistische ideaal. In alle drie organisaties was de invloed van de Solose vorstenhuizen groot; vooral Mangkoenegoro VII speelde als mentor, adviseur en financier een grote rol. Tegen deze machtsconcentratie waren soms radicale afdelingen als Batavia en Soerabaja niet opgewassen.

Naast dit Javaanse conglomeraat plaatst Van Miert de Jong Sumatranen Bond. Deze werd in 1917 in Batavia opgericht en behelsde een poging de heterogene van Sumatra afkomstige studenten te verenigen onder Groot-Sumatraanse banier, met als gezamenlijke kenmerken de taal, de geschiedenis en de voorspoedige economische toekomst. Het werkte gebrekkig, ondanks enthousiaste voorlieden als Amir, Jamin en Hatta. Zij hadden niet zo veel moeite hun ideaal in te ruilen voor een Indonesisch nationalisme. Jong Java had hiermee veel meer problemen. Het tweede Indonesische jeugdcongres waarop in 1928 de tot mythische proporties vergrote 'sumpah pemuda', jongerenreed, werd uitgesproken was dan ook niet zo'n euforisch vertoon van Indonesisch eenheidsgevoel als graag wordt voorgesteld – er waren veel reserves en voorbehouden, zoals Van Miert tot slot van zijn boek terecht laat zien.

Van Miert heeft na veel spuurwerk deze vier historische stiefkinderen hun rechtmatige plaats in het historische spectrum gegeven, waarbij overigens de Sumatraanse jongeren er nogal bijhangen. In zijn concentratie op de bestudeerde organisaties is het jammer dat het ingewikkelde Indonesische politieke landschap onvoldoende uit de verf komt. De niet-ingewijde lezer krijgt te weinig zicht op de verhoudingen waarbinnen Boedi Oetomo een rol speelde en wat het werkelijke gewicht van de organisatie was. Deze relatieve verwaarlozing van de sociaal-politieke context leidt ook tot onnauwkeurigheden daar waar wel uitstapjes buiten het Boedi-Oetomo-conglomeraat worden gemaakt. Maar misschien mogen we dat alles niet vragen naast de vierhonderd bladzijden levendige beschrijving van de lotgevallen van de vier organisaties.

Van Miert laat daarnaast de kans liggen het functioneren van de Volksraad en de inhoud van het begrip non-coöperatie te wegen en eventueel te herwaarderen. Hij echoot de standaardopvattingen over macht en invloed van de Volksraad: positief van de Nederlandse betrokkenen, negatief – vanzelfsprekend – van Indonesische betrokkenen toen. De latere geschiedschrijving heeft dit klakkeloos – en dan vooral negatief – overgenomen. Ook de veelgeplakte etiketten coöperatie en non-coöperatie zijn veel minder een tegenstelling dan graag wordt verondersteld; de overgang was veel vloeiender: en slechts zelden was er sprake van principiële keuzes. De interessante discussie over deze vraagstukken in het grotere politieke krachtenveld in Nederlands-Indië laat Van Miert liggen; met wat hij wel biedt kan men overigens tevreden zijn.

---

Verena Keck, *Historical atlas of ethnic and linguistic groups in Papua New Guinea, Volume 1, Part 3: Madang*, Basel: Wepf/University of Basel, Institute of Ethnology, 1995, x + 399 pp, 10 maps. ISBN 3.85977.192.2. Price: SFr. 95.

Jürg Wassmann, *Historical atlas of ethnic and linguistic groups in Papua New Guinea, Volume 3, Part 4: New Britain; Part 5: New Ireland; Part 6: Bougainville*, Basel: Wepf/University of Basel, Institute of Ethnology, 1995, ix + 185 pp, 30 maps. ISBN 3.85977.193.0. Price: SFr. 95.

GER P. REESINK

Volumes 1 and 3 of the *Historical Atlas of Ethnic and Linguistic Groups of Papua New Guinea* are the first instalments of a series that will comprise eleven parts. Volume 2 by Nigel Stephenson, which will contain Parts 1: North-West Coast and Part 2: Sepik/Highlands is nearing completion, the pre-publication flyer put out by the University of Basel informs us.

According to the introduction by Meinhard Schuster, which is virtually identical in both volumes, the project aims to assemble all the names of ethnic and linguistic groups that are to be found in the literature between 1873 and 1975, these dates marking the landing of Captain John Moresby on the island and the year of Independence of the State of Papua New Guinea.

Each part of the atlas is divided into five periods, delineated by significant events (except 1960, which simply signals a decade as a conventional cut-off point): 1873-1907, 1908-1921 (1908 was the year of the Hamburg South Seas expedition; in 1921 Australian civil administration began in the Mandated Territories of New Guinea), 1922-1946 (end of Second World War), 1947-1959, and 1961-1975. For each period there are separate sections for ethnic groups and languages. Each section begins with some general notes, followed by lists of names under the category 'mentioned' and 'mentioned without name' and a list of 'unspecified location'. Then follows the actual legend, often supplemented by ample quotations from the work in which the reference is found, and with cross-references to other names.

Most of the names from the legends are located on maps that correspond to the period and category. Hence volume 1, dealing with part 3: Madang, contains 10 maps: one for ethnic group names and one for linguistic group names for each period. These maps are loose-leaf and are placed in a pocket in the back-cover.

Each part of the atlas has an index of all the names that occur in the legends with indication of the relevant period and whether the name is actually on the map. If this is not the case, inspection of the legends can lead the reader to an alternate name which might be mapped. Finally, each part closes with a bibliography.

The work that has gone into compiling these volumes must have been considerable (and perhaps rather tedious). Whether the benefits are commensurate with those efforts is a question that occurred to me, but is one that I would not be able to answer. The atlas will certainly be

beneficial to scholars who (are planning to) work in a particular area and who would like to know what has been published in the past. Such scholars still need to do quite a bit of hunting through these books. For example, near Bogia in the Madang province there is a language Monumbo. This name is found in the legends referring to languages of the period 1947-1959 with references to the work of Capell and Tranel. This item then cross-references to the name Dalua under the category ethnic groups of the period 1908-1921. In the legend of this period, Dalua is not listed as a separate lemma, but simply as a recurrent name in the references under the lemma Monumbo. It can be found in the list 'mentioned'. Why certain names for ethnic or linguistic groups that are found in the literature are not included in the legend as lemmas, is not clear. It makes searching somewhat difficult. Also, forward reference to other periods is lacking: neither in the period 1908-1921, nor in the period 1947-1959 is there a reference to the work of Z'graggen, which dominates the section on languages (specifically of the Madang province) of the final period. Nevertheless, comparison of the period-specific maps and legends will yield all the relevant names with their bibliographic references, as long as one is content with information from before Independence.

This last qualification indicates some criticism. It is rather a pity that the date of Independence has been chosen as a limit to the atlas, even though it is an understandable ceasura. The post-1975 period has seen a lot of work, both in linguistics and anthropology, published, but it is not included. Considering the enormous amount of painstaking research and tracking down of less readily available old German sources which must have been done for these volumes, it would have been just a fraction of that work to include the more easily available recent data. Perhaps some reason for this decision is to be found in the second aim of the atlas, which Schuster states in his introduction, namely, to contribute to the general history (and more particular that of anthropological research) of the country.

Another question to which I have not found an answer concerns the rationale behind the geographical divisions of the parts, and their combination in volumes. Volume 3 contains parts 4, 5, and 6, of which each contains clearly demarcated areas, also recognizable as present-day provinces. Volume 1 contains part 3: Madang, which includes a lot more than the Madang province: most of Morobe province and a few Highlands provinces. Parts 1 and 2, however, will be published in volume 2: Sepik provinces and parts of the western Highlands. One wonders how the seventh geographic area, which covers only Manus province, will be published. Considering the size of the presently published volumes, it might have been included with the other island regions. No doubt, the scheduling of the individual researchers and their expertise with regard to particular areas is due to this rather confusing ordering and packaging.

Finally, I would like to conclude on a more positive note and express my admiration for Verena Keck and Jürg Wassmann who must have waded



through an impressive stack of books and articles. In spite of the (inevitable) mistakes and omissions – which I have not sought out deliberately – they have succeeded in bringing together most of the relevant literature of the century preceding the Independence of Papua New Guinea as a state. Even if the lay-out of the atlas requires leafing back and forth through the book, with a few maps spread out next to it, the scholar interested in a particular area has been spared many hours of library research.

---

Reimar Schefold (ed.), *Minahasa past and present; Tradition and transition in an outer island region of Indonesia*, Leiden: Research School CNWS, 1995, 128 pp. ISBN 90.73782.33.3.

K. TAUCHMANN

This book commemorates the first exhibition of its kind for the Minahasa region which was held at Museum Nusantara, Delft.

After an introduction by Reimar Schefold, Mieke Schouten deals with status-seeking in Minahasa. Her argument centres on ritual, and social and economic dimensions of being 'rich', emphasizing the growing importance of economic aspects of 'wealth' since the nineteenth century. At the same time she also stresses that the number of followers a person can assemble is still essential within vertical ranking of individuals. Since Reimar Schefold deals with myth and achievement in the following article, in which he compares Mentawai and Minahasa societies, his arguments adduced to show that heroic theft is an expression of individual action of benefit to others seem to fit into this modern environment. The diachronic discourse might even be a helpful contribution to an explanation of the conversion to Calvinism and its value system towards the end of the nineteenth century, the colonial ranking system giving preference to personal achievement among the 'bangsawan'.

David Henley illustrates the link between cartography and colonial history in Minahasa. Mapping is shown as the ritualized expression of shape and constitution dominated by colonial interests and connected to efforts to get control of an area. Existing political units were reduced or enlarged and borders established to comply with the needs of the bureaucracy. Besides these visualized expressions in cartography, colonial image construction in its historical dimension compared to the present peripheral, marginal, highly acculturated image of Manado is the central theme of the following article by Peter Nas.

Internal tensions in the peripheral region between colonial and integrated status are made obvious in the contribution of Kees van Dijk,

who considers the fate of the tiny Muslim enclaves, developed through intermarriages with Javanese and Sumatran exiles, and their relationship with a Christian majority. While adat in Muslim enclaves, which were growing largely through intermarriage of male exiles with local women and their subsequent descendants, seems to have been symbiotically interwoven with Islamic values, government interference with the family law of Christians in Minahasa, as Louise Gandhi-Lapian shows, had more far-reaching consequences and resulted in subterfuge regulations at the community level, mostly affecting the position of women, which were generated by adat requirements. Richard Leirissa's article pictures the Minahasa identity in its political dimension of national integration, its role during 'Permesta' and the final integration during 'New Order'.

Rili Djohani deals with a marginal minority within the integrated periphery, where Bajau people have been confronted with terrestrial values since colonial times. The author emphasizes the need for research into their knowledge of marine resource management to help them to enjoy their share in the economic transformation.

The overview presents a glimpse of Minahasa from past to present highlighted by a few topics. In line with the theme of transition, this was achieved by contributions from Minahasan authors; the beginning of a very promising dialogue indeed. One of the missing links seems to be an article on the Chinese communities and their relations with Minahasan Christians.

After a long period of scattered resistance, even the Minahasans capitulated to Dutch colonial rule, and most of them seemed to be very adaptive to change. Seizing upon the essence of this booklet, one could cast doubts on the extent of 'Westernization' or 'acculturation'. In other words, does metamorphosis touch the values of the fundamental corpus of adat or merely embellish it with some newly requested public image, should this be unavoidable. For the period after Independence to the present, the dynamics of Minahasa culture still seem to be fairly obscure. This holds true especially of the local reactions in the post-colonial era where one can postulate a renaissance of Minahasan culture since the sixties through revivalist movements (*opuopu*'-cult) counteracted by determined efforts of GMIM officials, even assisted by Dutch ministers to 'purify' Calvinistic Christian beliefs.

---

Barbara Watson Andaya, *To live as brothers; Southeast Sumatra in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1993, xvii + 324 pp. ISBN 0.8248.1489.4. Price: US\$ 38.

REINOUT VOS

*To live as brothers* is the history of the Sultanates of Jambi and Palembang at the time of the VOC. In the 17th century, both states were important pepper exporters, with Jambi having the upper hand for a long time. In the 18th century, while Jambi's economy gradually dwindled due to falling pepper prices, Palembang rose to legendary prosperity by exploiting its tin mines on Bangka. Andaya's historical reconstruction is, of course, primarily based on European sources; being the first modern English-language history of pre-1800 Southeast Sumatra, it is an invaluable contribution in a field which has hardly been explored by modern scholars. Interwoven with the historical account, the author regularly explores a number of themes which she formulated on the basis of Malay oral and written traditions: the relations between *ulu* and *ilir* (upstream and downstream); between king and subject; and between kinship and economic or political activity. To mention a few examples, Andaya explains to us the mechanisms by which economic growth fostered closer and more forceful links between the downstream court and the upstream (interior) pepper-growing areas; how women, not only through marriage but also as shared concubines, played a crucial role in the relationship between court and foreign communities, and how even the resident Dutch VOC employees could, in Jambi especially to a very far extent, become integrated in the court system. In this last respect, though not the intention of the author, the 'brothers' of the book's title could just as well have included the VOC, to whose administrators the South Sumatran courts would, not less than among themselves, refer as 'brother', 'son', 'father' or 'grandfather', depending on the level of the person addressed.

The thematic excursions with their many fascinating and often unexpected perspectives form a welcome enrichment of the historical account itself, which contains a wealth of information but sometimes lacks vividness. A reason for this could be that the author has used nineteenth-century Malay sources primarily for the thematic approach, not giving them full weight as a historical source. To my surprise, I found that even the great 'handbook' on Bugis-Malay history, *Tuhfat al-Nafis*, is scarcely quoted, though Andaya herself is co-editor of the English edition. Especially in the last chapters, I feel that the *Tuhfat*'s view on what happened in the late eighteenth century Malay maritime world would have contributed to a much sharper and more dramatic picture than Andaya's somewhat ambivalent notion of 'decline' between quotation marks.

Leaving aside these general remarks, as well as a few minor errors (e.g., Andaya's assertion on p. 214 that the principle of free navigation in the eastern seas, accepted by the VOC in 1784, would have dealt the death blow to its Indonesian commerce), this is an important and illuminating book, immediately recognizable as the scrupulous work of an outstanding scholar in Malay history.

---

*Addendum*

In *Bijdragen* 150:435-436 a review was published of *Nationalismus und Personenkult im indonesischen Geschichtsverständnis*, a PhD dissertation defended at the Universität Hamburg in 1993 by Klaus H. Schreiner-Brauch. Of this study a revised edition has been published, of which the bibliographical information is as follows: Klaus H. Schreiner, *Politischer Heldenkult in Indonesien; Tradition und moderne Praxis*. Berlin/Hamburg: Reimer, 1995, 333 pp. [Veröffentlichungen des Seminars für Indonesische und Südseesprachen der Universität Hamburg 21]. ISBN 3.496.02557.3. Price: DM 84.